



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 59

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Ninth Legislature

Wednesday, December 5, 2018

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair at 9:00 a.m.

Government Bills and Orders

Committee of the Whole

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of the Whole and the Deputy Speaker left the Chair.

(Assembly in Committee)

The following Bill was taken under consideration:

Bill 32 City Charters Fiscal Framework Act — Hon. Mr. S. Anderson

The question was put that Bill 32, City Charters Fiscal Framework Act, be reported, which was agreed to. With Ms Jabbour at the Table, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 46

Anderson (Leduc-Beaumont)	Gotfried	McCuaig-Boyd
Babcock	Gray	McKittrick
Bilous	Hanson	Miller
Carlier	Hinkley	Miranda
Carson	Hoffman	Orr
Ceci	Horne	Piquette
Coolahan	Hunter	Pitt
Cortes-Vargas	Kazim	Rosendahl
Dach	Kleinsteuber	Schreiner
Dang	Littlewood	Starke
Drever	Loewen	Stier
Eggen	Loyola	Sucha
Feehan	Luff	Sweet
Fitzpatrick	Malkinson	Turner
Ganley	Mason	Woollard
Goodridge		

Against the motion: 0

And after some time spent therein, the Deputy Speaker resumed the Chair.

The following Bill was reported:

Bill 32 City Charters Fiscal Framework Act — Hon. Mr. S. Anderson

The following Bill was reported with some amendments:

Bill 30 Mental Health Services Protection Act — Hon. Ms Hoffman

Ms Woollard, Acting Chair of Committees, tabled copies of all amendments considered by Committee of the Whole on this date for the official records of the Assembly.

Subamendment to Bill 30 (A1-SA1) (Hon. Member for Fort McMurray-Wood Buffalo) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 443/2018

Amendment to Bill 30 (A1) (Hon. Deputy Premier, Minister of Health) — Agreed to

Sessional Paper 444/2018

Amendment to Bill 30 (A2) (Hon. Member for Fort McMurray-Wood Buffalo) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 445/2018

Amendment to Bill 30 (A3) (Hon. Member for Vermilion-Lloydminster) — Agreed to

Sessional Paper 446/2018

Third Reading

The following Bill was read a Third time and passed:

Bill 32 City Charters Fiscal Framework Act — Hon. Mr. S. Anderson

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Feehan, Deputy Government House Leader, that it be called 12:00 p.m., the Assembly adjourned at 11:57 a.m. until 1:30 p.m.

WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 5, 2018 — 1:30 PM

ROUTINE

Members' Statements

Mr. Gotfried, Hon. Member for Calgary-Fish Creek, made a statement regarding negative economic and social developments since the 2015 Provincial General Election and hope for the future following the 2019 election.

Mrs. Schreiner, Hon. Member for Red Deer-North, made a statement regarding how the Government's Community Initiative Program and Community Facility Enhancement Program have benefitted Red Deer.

Mr. Taylor, Hon. Member for Battle River-Wainwright, made a statement reflecting on his time as a Member of the Legislative Assembly.

Mr. Westhead, Hon. Member for Banff-Cochrane, made a statement regarding Government action to make hunting and fishing more accessible in Alberta in contrast to the United Conservative Party's views on public land management.

Ms Sweet, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, made a statement regarding her fond memories of past Christmas holidays.

Mr. Sucha, Hon. Member for Calgary-Shaw, made a statement regarding the rise in tooth decay in Calgary since the city removed fluoride from its water system in 2011.

Presenting Reports by Standing and Special Committees

Mr. Cyr, Chair, Standing Committee on Public Accounts, presented the following report:

Standing Committee on Public Accounts, 2018 Annual Report
Sessional Paper 447/2018

Presenting Petitions

Mr. Clark, Hon. Member for Calgary-Elbow, presented a petition from 354 Albertans urging the Government to reinvest at least 50% of any savings anticipated from generic drug cost reductions resulting from the 5-year agreement recently negotiated between the pan-Canadian Pharmaceutical Alliance and the Canadian Generic Pharmaceutical Association effective April 1, 2018, into frontline pharmacy services and programs to ensure the delivery of better healthcare for Albertans and the sustainability and job security of the thousands of Albertans employed in pharmacies and drugstores across our province, including Alberta pharmacists who have a demonstrably positive impact on the healthcare outcomes of Albertans and do save the healthcare system money.

Mr. Clark, Hon. Member for Calgary-Elbow, on behalf of Mr. Fraser, Hon. Member for Calgary-South East, presented a petition from hundreds of Albertans urging the Government to reinvest at least 50% of any savings anticipated from generic drug cost reductions resulting from the 5-year agreement recently negotiated between the pan-Canadian Pharmaceutical Alliance and the Canadian Generic Pharmaceutical Association effective April 1, 2018, into frontline pharmacy services and programs to ensure the delivery of better healthcare for Albertans and the sustainability and job security of the thousands of Albertans employed in pharmacies and drugstores across our province, including Alberta pharmacists who have a demonstrably positive impact on the healthcare outcomes of Albertans and do save the healthcare system money.

Tabling Returns and Reports

Mr. Shepherd, Chair, Standing Committee on Legislative Offices, pursuant to the Election Act, cE-1, s4(6):

Report of the Chief Electoral Officer on the July 12, 2018, by-elections in Fort McMurray-Conklin and Innisfail-Sylvan Lake

Sessional Paper 448/2018

Mr. Yao, Hon. Member for Fort McMurray-Wood Buffalo:

11 letters to United Conservative Party Members of the Legislative Assembly expressing concern regarding the proposed Bill 30, Mental Health Services Protection Act

Sessional Paper 449/2018

Letter dated December 3, 2018, from Crystal Smalldon, Executive Director, Canadian Addiction Counsellors Certification Federation, to the United Conservative Party caucus expressing concerns regarding the proposed Bill 30, Mental Health Services Protection Act, and asking that it not be passed but reviewed with affected stakeholders

Sessional Paper 450/2018

Mr. Piquette, Hon. Member for Athabasca-Sturgeon-Redwater:

Several letters from students, parents, and teachers of H.A. Kostash School in Smoky Lake to Hon. Ms Notley, Premier, regarding the poor condition of their school and requesting that a new school be built, relating to comments made by Mr. Piquette in the Assembly the previous week

Sessional Paper 451/2018

Letter, undated, from Mr. Piquette, Hon. Member for Athabasca-Sturgeon-Redwater, to Hon. Mr. Eggen, Minister of Education, urging the Ministry to prioritize the replacement of H.A. Kostash School in Smoky Lake

Sessional Paper 452/2018

Mr. Barnes, Hon. Member for Cypress-Medicine Hat:

Letter, undated, from Hon. Min. Ceci, President of Treasury Board and Minister of Finance, to Mr. Cyr, Chair, Standing Committee on Public Accounts, regarding changes to be made to the Government's year-end financial reporting for the 2018-19 fiscal year

Sessional Paper 453/2018

Ms Fitzpatrick, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East:

Petition regarding the Fair Start for Families Campaign, signed by hundreds of Albertans urging the Government to expand the \$25-per-day Alberta Early Learning and Child Care Centres pilot program so that it is accessible to all Alberta families, to phase out public subsidies to for-profit child care providers, and to create a concrete plan with clear timelines to build a universal system of early childhood education and care in Alberta

Sessional Paper 454/2018

Mr. Westhead, Hon. Member for Banff-Cochrane:

Letter dated November 27, 2018, from Backcountry Hunters and Anglers expressing concern that the United Conservative Party is developing a policy which would sell unproductive or uneconomic Crown land and to use the funds to pay off Alberta's provincial debt, relating to comments made by Mr. Westhead in his Member's Statement on December 5, 2018

Sessional Paper 455/2018

Mr. Gotfried, Hon. Member for Calgary-Fish Creek:

Calgary Herald website article, undated, entitled "Suncor CEO warns foreign 'exodus' from oilsands may not be over," relating to comments made by Mr. Gotfried in his Member's Statement and during Oral Question Period on December 5, 2018

Sessional Paper 456/2018

Fraser Research Bulletin dated August 2018 entitled “The Illusion of Alberta’s Job Recovery: Government vs. Private Sector Employment,” relating to comments made by Mr. Gotfried in his Member’s Statement and during Oral Question Period on December 5, 2018

Sessional Paper 457/2018

Global News website article, undated, entitled “Number of unemployed Albertans living without EI benefits remains high: report,” relating to comments made by Mr. Gotfried in his Member’s Statement and during Oral Question Period on December 5, 2018

Sessional Paper 458/2018

Document entitled “Statistics Canada, Table 5, Labour force characteristics by province, age group and sex, seasonally adjusted (Quebec, Ontario, Manitoba, Saskatchewan, Alberta, and British Columbia),” relating to comments made by Mr. Gotfried in his Member’s Statement and during Oral Question Period on December 5, 2018

Sessional Paper 459/2018

Hon. Ms Hoffman, Deputy Premier, Minister of Health:

Vancouver Sun website article dated December 4, 2018, entitled “Daphne Bramham: The missing harm-reduction measure? Regulating mental health workers,” relating to comments made by Hon. Ms Hoffman during Committee of the Whole consideration of Bill 30, Mental Health Services Protection Act, on December 5, 2018

Sessional Paper 460/2018

Ms Kazim, Hon. Member for Calgary-Glenmore:

Edmonton Journal website article dated March 29, 2018, entitled “Opinion: Mental health professionals in Alberta need regulation”

Sessional Paper 461/2018

Dr. Starke, Hon. Member for Vermilion-Lloydminster:

Technology Review website article dated November 23, 2018, entitled “Seaweed could make cows burp less methane and cut their carbon hoofprint”

Sessional Paper 462/2018

Ms Luff, Hon. Member for Calgary-East:

Letter dated December 4, 2018, from Ms Luff, Hon. Member for Calgary-East, to Hon. Mr. Wanner, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly, outlining a number of concerns regarding Legislative Assembly practices, which she would like to be considered at the next meeting of the Special Standing Committee on Members’ Services

Sessional Paper 463/2018

Edmonton Journal website article dated November 25, 2018, entitled “ ‘We are stuck’: Mobile home residents in east Edmonton lose advocate for change”
Sessional Paper 464/2018

Tablings to the Clerk

Acting Clerk (Procedure) of the Assembly on behalf of Hon. Mr. Sabir, Minister of Community and Social Services:

Pursuant to the Premier’s Council on Alberta’s Promise Act, cP-20.5, s7(2), Alberta’s Promise, Annual Report 2017-18

Sessional Paper 465/2018

Pursuant to the Premier’s Council on the Status of Persons with Disabilities Act, cP-21, s7(2), Premier’s Council on the Status of Persons with Disabilities, Annual Report 2017-2018

Sessional Paper 466/2018

Pursuant to the Protection Against Family Violence Act, cP-27, s19(2), Family Violence Death Review Committee, 2016 Annual Report

Sessional Paper 467/2018

Privilege – Comments Made by the Hon. Minister of Municipal Affairs

Honourable Members, yesterday morning at 11:25 a.m. the Member for Calgary-Greenway provided notice to my office of a question of privilege that he intended to raise in the Assembly. I heard arguments yesterday afternoon and am prepared to rule today.

Under Standing Order 15(2), a Member wishing to raise a question of privilege must provide notice to my office at least two hours before the opening of the afternoon sitting. While this deadline was met, the Member did not, based on the comments made yesterday by the Government House Leader, provide a similar notice by that time to the Members whose conduct would be called into question, which is also required by the Standing Order.

Notwithstanding this procedural deficiency, I have reviewed the substance of the matter and concluded that the Member for Calgary-Greenway has not met the test for a prima facie case of breach of privilege or contempt. In fact, the Member for the most part in his arguments drifted into matters pertaining to political parties, and little was said as to the reasons why the comments made by the Minister of Municipal Affairs and the Government House Leader on November 29, 2018, would give rise to a question of privilege.

An alleged breach of privilege or contempt, as I have said in the House many times, is a very serious matter, and the Member’s arguments did not support such a finding.

As the Member for Calgary-Greenway notes in his letter providing notice of the question of privilege to my office, I ruled last Thursday that the comments made by the Minister of Municipal were out of order.

The Member for Calgary-Greenway could have raised a question of privilege under Standing Order 15(5) on the day the words were spoken, but he chose to proceed by way of a point of order. He cannot now revisit the matter as a question of privilege.

Furthermore, the Member was clearly aware at the time the comments were made that they were offensive to him, and by waiting until yesterday to raise the matter as a question of privilege, he has not done so at the earliest opportunity as required by Standing Order 15(6).

Accordingly, I find that there is no prima facie question of privilege.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Bills and Orders

Third Reading

Pursuant to Government Motion 36 agreed to on November 22, 2018, Hon. Ms Ganley, Deputy Government House Leader, advised the Assembly that there would be no evening sitting today.

The following Bills were read a Third time and passed:

- Bill 22 An Act for Strong Families Building Stronger Communities — Hon. Min. Larivee
- Bill 23 An Act to Renew Local Democracy in Alberta — Hon. Mr. S. Anderson
- Bill 27 Joint Governance of Public Sector Pension Plans Act — Hon. Min. Ceci
- Bill 30 Mental Health Services Protection Act — Hon. Ms Hoffman

Hon. Ms Ganley, Deputy Government House Leader, requested and received the unanimous consent of the Assembly that, notwithstanding Standing Order 3(1), the morning sitting on Thursday, December 6, 2018, be cancelled.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Ms Ganley, Deputy Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 4:51 p.m. until Thursday, December 6, 2018, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Robert E. Wanner,
Speaker

Title: Wednesday, December 5, 2018